

## REVIEWS

*The emergence of the modern language sciences: Studies in the transition from historical-comparative to structural linguistics in honour of E.F.K. Koerner*. 1999. Edited by Sheila Embleton, John E. Joseph and Hans-Josef Niederehe. Amsterdam and Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company. 2 vols.

Reviewed by Arleta Adamska-Sałaciak, Adam Mickiewicz University, Poznań, Poland

Reviewing a festschrift is a delicate matter. While in principle always a noble undertaking, this type of publication frequently contains contributions of unequal quality and seldom manages to focus on a common theme. It is therefore a relief to find the book under review to be virtually free of flaws of either type. Its remarkable degree of thematic coherence is particularly visible in the first volume (*Historiographical perspectives*), where the emphasis is on structuralism, its precursors and aftermath. Papers fall into three sections: *Before Saussure* (Part I), *Saussure* (Part II) and *After Saussure* (Part III), where the title of Part I means, in most cases, the 19<sup>th</sup> century, rather than, e.g., "from Plato/Panini etc. to Saussure". The second volume (*Methodological perspectives and applications*) contains a methodologically-oriented first section (Part IV) plus three others, where the uniting theme is in each case genetic relationship: "Indo-European linguistics" (Part V), "Latin and comparative Romance linguistics" (Part VI), and "Germanic, Caucasian and Asian linguistics" (Part VII). The case for the last grouping is not particularly strong, given that it contains three papers on Germanic and one each on Tsez, Korean and Bahnaric.

Of course, one cannot realistically expect a festschrift to be thematically fully homogeneous, especially when the recipient is a scholar of such broad interests as Konrad Koerner. Besides, despite being (arguably) more loosely structured, volume two contains more papers of potential interest to a wider linguistic audience. This is only to be expected, since the topics dealt with there are not restricted to one particular scholar or one publication, as is sometimes – necessarily – the case with strictly historiographic studies. Naturally, drawing the line between pure linguistic historiography versus methodology is a largely arbitrary matter. A case in point is, e.g., Regna Darnell's examination of the relations between and consequences of "Indo-European methodology, Bloomfield's Central Algonquian and Sapir's distant genetic relationships" (in Part IV), which would fit equally well in either volume.

Given the profile of the present journal and my beliefs about the potential readership of the respective volumes, what I want to attempt below is a (necessarily subjective) guided tour of volume two, with only occasional references to papers in the first volume.<sup>1</sup>

But first, some general observations. The main body of the book is preceded by a substantial Introduction and a full bibliography of Koerner's writings. In the Introduction, in addition to offering a convincing justification for their decision regarding the structure of the

---

<sup>1</sup> I take it that specialists in linguistic historiography will have reached for the book anyway; where it needs to be advertised is among linguists in general.

book, the Editors have also provided short descriptions of the contents of all the forty-two contributions.

Apart from Jivco Boyadjiev's "Ferdinand de Saussure en Bulgarie" (Part II) and Emilio Rodriuejo's "La concepción del cambio fonético de Ramón Menéndez Pidal" (Part III), all the remaining papers are in English. Most appear to have been written especially for the occasion, although one author (John Joseph in an informative and entertaining account of "Dufliche-Desgenettes and the birth of the phoneme", Part I) reveals that he had had to wait ten years for this opportunity to publish his findings. One offering (Thomas V. Gamkrelidze's "Typology and reconstruction: New trends in comparative historical linguistics") seems merely to restate the case for a theory proposed by the author (together with V.V. Ivanov) some decades ago and argued for ever since. But then the Glottalic Theory is no mean achievement and many readers will probably find this reminder of it useful. Another paper where the author deals with a long-time favourite of his is "Narrative cohesion in the Kensington Runic Text" by the late Robert A. Hall, Jr. New arguments are offered for the authenticity of the text in question, making this final defence a vindication of a view championed by the author for half a century. Among the papers that stand out – for one reason or another – one should also mention Danny D. Steinberg's passionate attack on Chomsky ("How the anti-mentalizer skeletons in Chomsky's closet make psychological fictions of his grammars", Part III), which reads in places like an undergraduate's essay and/or a collection of notes for an informal presentation.<sup>2</sup> Having said that, one cannot but agree that Chomsky-type grammars are a non-starter for psycholinguistics.

Let us now have a somewhat more detailed look at volume two. Very conveniently for the reviewer, the titles in Part IV are practically self-explanatory. Darnell's opening paper has been mentioned above; Saul Levin elaborates on "The need for phonetically accurate notation in the general progress of linguistics"; Ranko Bugarski discusses "The autonomy of linguistics: Saussure to Chomsky and beyond"; E. Wyn Roberts gives an impressive overview "On the notion of zero" in linguistics; John T. Jensen takes us through 20<sup>th</sup> c. linguistic formalisms "From ordered rules to ranked constraints". When it comes to originality (no irony intended!), I would like to single out Gary D. Prideaux "'God's truth' and structuralism: A new look at an old controversy", where it is argued, on the basis of two psycholinguistic experiments involving discourse analysis, that the constructs of constituent structure and markedness are not merely convenient fictions, but have significant cognitive content.

In the section devoted to Indo-European (Part V) we find Alan R. Bomhard's account of the history of the Nostratic hypothesis ("Next of kin: The search for relatives of Indo-European"). Even readers to whom this whole area of research seems distinctly far-fetched should find this interesting, especially that knowledge of the Soviet and Russian scholars whose work in this area has been absolutely vital is still relatively poor in the West. Following Gamkrelidze's contribution (see above), Helena Kurzova examines the "Typology and diachrony of the middle voice" as developed since the 19<sup>th</sup> c., and Vit Bubenik looks at the views of "Berthold Delbrück and his contemporaries on 'tempora' in Sanskrit". What I have found most interesting in this section are Carol F. Justus's arguments against the supposedly

<sup>2</sup> To quote more or less at random, statements such as: "Skinner's foolish Behaviorist-based assertions about language were just too much for Chomsky" (272) are not at all untypical.

decimal character of the Indo-European numeral system ("Indo-European numerals since Szemerényi"). Demonstrating how the reconstruction of this aspect of linguistic prehistory must take account of the enormous variety of developments in the world's counting systems, this is a spectacular example of the intricacies and rewards of studying human intellectual history in all its complexity.

The section on Romance (Part VI) is my personal favourite. All the papers (Philip Baldi's "Observations on two recently discovered Latin inscriptions", Roger Wright's "Comparative structural and sociolinguistic analyses of the history of the Romance languages", Martin Maiden's "Romance historical morphology and empty affixes", John Charles Smith's "Markedness and morpho-syntactic change revisited: The case of Romance past participle agreement", and Brian D. Joseph's "Romanian and the Balkans: Some comparative perspectives") are solidly based in data, engagingly presented, and have important theoretical implications. Especially thought-provoking is Wright's questioning of the usefulness of the historical comparative method for the study of Early Romance; Smith's sober assessment of the value of markedness hierarchies for analysing morphosyntactic developments is also a must.

The final, miscellaneous section (Part VII) opens with a defence of a phonological (as opposed to morpholexical) analysis of the residues of OHG umlaut by David J. Holsinger and Joseph C. Salmons. This is followed by Robert A. Hall Jr.'s paper mentioned above, and by Matsuji Tajima's examination of "The compound gerund in Early Modern English". Bernard Comrie's "Gender affixes in Tsez: Synchrony and diachrony" is a paragon of detailed and insightful analysis of fragmentary linguistic data, pointing to the complex interplay of synchronic and diachronic factors in the development of gender markers in the language in question. Students of Korean historical linguistics will no doubt welcome Alexander Vovin's contribution to the debate over the reading of one controversial Old Korean character, whereas those working in the area of Austroasiatic should pause after reading Paul Sidwell's paper ("The role of historiography in evaluating the results of comparative linguistic work: A case study"), which questions the methodology behind some widely accepted Bahnaric reconstructions.

Given the necessary briefness of this account and, perhaps more importantly, the limitations of my knowledge of the subject matter, I could not possibly do justice to all the papers, especially those dealing with non-Indo-European languages. For whatever it is worth, I am comforted by the thought that not many reviewers would be equal to the task, since the range of topics covered in the book under review is much wider than the expertise of even the most distinguished students of our discipline.

*Phonetics and Phonology for Students of English*. 1999. By Višnja Josipović. Targa: Zagreb.

Reviewed by Jolanta Szypra-Kozłowska, Maria Curie-Skłodowska University, Lublin, Poland

The book under review is an introduction to phonetics and phonology addressed primarily to university students of English in Croatia. As such it joins a large number of introductory handbooks dealing with these two disciplines which have been published over the last several years. The reasons why such manuals keep appearing are fairly obvious; a particularly dynamic development of phonological theory we have been witnessing within the last

three decades makes any textbook outdated within a rather short period of time, hence the constant need for new or revised versions. Yet, in spite of a growing number of such books, a phonology teacher to university students of English in countries such as Croatia, Poland or Germany, where courses in linguistics constitute only a small part of the curriculum, finds the majority of them of little usefulness for his purposes. Thus, such handbooks are usually too broad in scope and too full of technical details for students who do not specialize in linguistics. Moreover, they are usually based on the analyses of languages totally unfamiliar to the learner, which does not enhance the comprehension of complex theoretical issues.

Višnja Josipović's book is a very welcome attempt to fill this gap as it is aimed at the particular readers, namely, university students of English in Croatia, and geared specifically to their needs. This means a conscious adoption of several limitations. Thus, phonological theory is presented here in rather general outlines with many details and technicalities omitted on purpose. Moreover, language data are limited to facts of English and Croatian, readily accessible to Croatian learners, with only occasional references to other languages.

It is clear that *Phonetics and phonology* has been written by an experienced teacher, sensitive to her students' needs. This can be seen not only in the choice of analytic data and theoretical background, but also in the lucid and straightforward style adopted by the author as well as in a variety of pedagogical devices meant to facilitate the learning process such as lists of figures, tables and charts, the IPA symbols, abbreviations, words typically mispronounced, name, language and subject indices, all found at the end of the book. Moreover, each chapter contains a set of exercises to consolidate the material presented earlier and various problems for further study.

The book under review contains ten chapters, five of which are concerned with phonetics, four with phonology and one dealing with the differences between these two disciplines.

Chapter 1 defines briefly the fields of phonetics and phonology, and clarifies in a simple and accessible manner the major differences between these two approaches to sound systems.

Chapter 2 constitutes a short introduction to articulatory phonetics. It deals with the anatomy and functions of the organs of speech and the mechanism of sound production.

Chapter 4, under the somewhat misleading title of 'Phonemic systems', discusses the most important articulatory features of English speech sounds. Here the reader finds the traditional classification of English consonants according to different places and manners of articulation, followed by the presentation of vowels and diphthongs within Jones's Cardinal Vowel Chart. The sounds in question are those of Received Pronunciation. Frequent references are made, however, to General American and other dialects of English. Needless to say, the description of English sounds is often juxtaposed with those found in Croatian.

In Chapter 5 the author goes beyond the familiar pulmonic egressive vowels and consonants of English and Croatian, and, in order to demonstrate that they constitute only a small portion of possible speech sounds, presents a large variety of other segments such as implosives, ejectives, clicks, gutturals, etc. found in many so-called 'exotic' languages. The chapter also discusses some aspects of allophonic variation in English. The emphasis here is on the IPA symbols employed in recording various sounds and their allophones.

Chapter 6 centres round connected speech phenomena in English. It deals briefly with strong and weak forms, stress shift in phrases, as well as with various phonostylistic processes such as assimilations, liaison, elisions, smoothing and coalescence.

Chapter 7, considerably longer than the previous ones, is devoted to the basic elements of the acoustic analysis of speech. It contains a lot of useful drawings, figures and spectrograms.

To sum up, the first part of the book constitutes a clear and concise introduction to the major aspects of English phonetics. All the new concepts and terms are explained in a simple and accessible way, and should present no major problem to beginner-students of linguistics.

It should be added, however, that some issues are treated too cursorily in my view. Thus, allophonic variation and connected speech phenomena deserve a fuller presentation and a comparison with Croatian data. What I also find missing here is at least a brief mention if not a fuller discussion of suprasegmental phonetics<sup>3</sup>; in view of its absence the reader might draw an erroneous conclusion that prosodic issues are not a concern of phonetics. I would have also expected a fuller treatment of phonetic interference and problems that Croatian learners have in mastering the sounds of English (with possibly some advice how to cope with them).

The remaining part of the book is devoted to phonology. Before we proceed to discuss it in some detail, several general comments are in order.

An author of a phonology handbook for the beginners faces a difficult problem of selecting the theoretical framework and the amount of technical detail to be taught. This is not an easy task in view of a large variety of competing and ever-changing phonological models which have been proposed within the last several decades, their considerable complexity and a high degree of abstractness, coupled with the limited time allotted to teaching phonology at departments of English.

What Višnja Josipović has decided to do in her book – and rightly in my view – is to give the students a general idea of what the major modern frameworks of phonology are like and provide some samples of analyses proposed within these models without, however, going into various disputes and controversies which characterize this field of inquiry likely to confuse the uninitiated learner. Thus, she starts with some fundamental notions of the traditional structural analysis, then proceeds to discuss the major assumptions of classical generative phonology and its further extensions in the form of Lexical Phonology, non-linear phonology and Prosodic Phonology to end up with a brief sketch of a nonderivational model of Optimality Theory. This arrangement allows the student to gain insight into the working of different, but clearly interconnected models of phonology and to follow the most important developments of modern phonological theory.

Chapter 3, sandwiched somewhat illogically between sections devoted to phonetics, introduces the basic notions of structural analysis such as the phoneme, allophones, complementary and contrastive distribution, free variation, neutralization and – in anticipation of generative phonology – distinctive features.

Chapter 8, the second longest in the book, is concerned with generative phonology, its major tenets and developments.

First the author presents a brief outline of the classical generative framework focusing on distinctive features, phonological rules and their ordering, and notational conventions.

My objections here concern the choice of distinctive features which are a strange mixture taken from several sources. This is understandable in view of the lack of one commonly accepted set of features, but sometimes results in some inconsistencies. For instance, the feature [dorsal] refers to the articulation which involves the body of the tongue, yet it is assigned to the articulator features rather than the tongue body features constituting a separate set. The feature [anterior] which defines the consonantal place of articulation is grouped together with

<sup>3</sup> Prosodic phenomena are discussed in Chapter 9, entitled 'Prosodic phonology', which might wrongly suggest that these issues are of concern to phonology, but not of phonetics.

the manner features<sup>4</sup>. It is not clear either why the English short back vowel [o] is specified as mid (i.e. as [-low] and [-high]), whereas [æ] and [ʌ] which are of similar height are treated as [+low] (p. 96).

What I find missing here is a discussion of the distinction between underlying and surface representations and the notion of phonological derivation, both of which are hallmarks of generative phonology.

The next sections of Chapter 8 deal with the most important modifications of the classical generative framework. The author presents the basic aspects of the nonlinear models of autosegmental phonology and Feature Geometry. Traditional linear phonological representations and feature-changing rules are contrasted here with multi-tiered feature-geometric structures and autosegmental mechanisms of delinking and spreading.

The chapter is concluded with a sketch of Lexical Phonology. The author concentrates here on the division of phonological rules into lexical and postlexical. No mention is made, however, of strict cyclicity, morphological levels and different classes of English affixes, all of which play a significant role in this model.

In short, Chapter 8 introduces the student to very complex mechanisms of generative analysis, which is not an easy task, and attempts to cover over twenty years of generative research within 22 pages. This somewhat excessive brevity means that the presentation is rather sketchy and full of omissions. In my view beginner-students might find it rather difficult to follow this condensed maze of new and complex concepts. Therefore, there is no doubt that the discussion of many issues must be supplemented by other sources. It is also a pity that only English data are analysed throughout this chapter as if the generative approach were inapplicable to Croatian and other languages.

Chapter 9, entitled 'Prosodic Phonology', is the longest (44 pages, as opposed to other chapters of 6-20 pages on average), the most detailed and, the same time, the most interesting part of the book under review. The author gives up here her earlier method of presenting only a brief outline of a phonological model followed by a couple of illustrative examples and examines various prosodic issues in some depth, including a discussion of competitive approaches to several aspects of English and Croatian suprasegmental phonology. This emphasis on prosody is clearly a result of Josipović's own scholarly interests which centre round English and Croatian intonation. She is clearly at her best when discussing phonological problems she has actively researched herself.

In this Chapter the reader will find an introduction to the syllable, its constituents and well-known principles such as the Sonority Sequencing Generalization and the Maximal Onset Principle, all of which are illustrated with appropriate examples from English. The unit of the mora is then shown to be indispensable in the description of the Croatian 'long' and 'short' accents. A particularly interesting is the author's interpretation in prosodic terms of the formation of hypocoristics and some language games in English and Croatian.

Further sections of this Chapter deal with some aspects of English word stress and the basic assumptions of Metrical Phonology. This is followed by the definition of the remaining units of the prosodic hierarchy – the foot, the phonological word, the phonological phrase, the

<sup>4</sup> Another problem with the feature [anterior] concerns its definition. According to the author (p. 94.), 'anterior segments include labial and dental consonants.' It is not clear why alveolar consonants are excluded from this category.

intonation phrase and the utterance. With these tools of analysis clarified, the author proceeds to compare the rhythmic systems of English and Croatian to finally concentrate on current issues in contemporary intonology. The latter problem is presented in considerable detail which includes a discussion of a variety of models and approaches to intonation (holistic vs. compositional approaches, the Pierrehumbert model, etc.). I find this section very interesting and useful for advanced students of linguistics, but certainly too difficult and technical for the beginners.

The longest chapter of the book is followed by the shortest one (2.5 pages) whose aim is to present an outline of a nonderivational, constraint-based model of Optimality Theory which has dominated phonological research in the USA since the 1990's. There is no doubt that this brevity can be regarded as too extreme for pedagogical purposes.

To sum up the phonology part of the book, it successfully fulfils the author's aim to provide the reader with basic information on the major trends in modern phonological research and give him a general idea of what phonological analysis is like. What is striking here, however, is a certain lack of proportion in the treatment of individual issues some of which are discussed at length while others are treated very cursorily.

In conclusion, I regard the book under review a very welcome addition to the existing literature on phonetics and phonology. It introduces these disciplines in a 'learner-friendly' manner and will certainly be an invaluable help in teaching them to students of English in Croatia. Its selected sections, however, can also be used by linguistics students in other countries as well. In view of various limitations of *Phonetics and phonology for Students of English*, supplementing it with other sources will sometimes be in order.